DEPARTMENT OF STATE CONGRESSIONAL CORRESPONDENCE TASKER

IPS CONTROL# H2011 04/14 = 008 ACTION BUREAU: GAC
DATE: 4/14/11

IPS:

X SUBSTANTIVE CONSTITUENT
X IMAGE ENTIRE DOCUMENT IMAGE ONLY FIRST PAGES

BUREAU:

BUREAU ACTION REQUESTED: RESPOND TO CCU 2 DAYS FROM: 

X REPLY FOR SIGNATURE BY Joseph E. Macmanus, ACTING ASSISTANT SECRETARY, LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS

ADDRESS ENVELOPE TO DISTRICT OFFICE

DIRECT REPLY TO CONSTITUENT BY OFFICE DIRECTOR WITH COPY TO CONGRESSIONAL OFFICE. PHONE 7-1608 WHEN COMPLETED

FYI ONLY/NO RESPONSE NECESSARY

REPLY FOR SIGNATURE DIRECTLY BY BUREAU

OTHER ACTION: 

FOR GUIDANCE/INFORMATION ON FORMATTING CONGRESSIONALS SEE:
http://dilopedia.state.gov/index.php?title=Bureau of Legislative Affairs Reference Documents#Yellow Border

Due Date 4/14/11

****BUREAUS MUST MAKE TRANSFERS OF ACTION DIRECTLY WITH RECEIVING BUREAU'S FRONT OFFICE. THE CCU HAS A LISTING OF CONTACTS. PLEASE NOTIFY CCU 7-1608 OF ALL TRANSFERS OF ACTION****
FROM: Joseph E. Macmanus (H)

APR 14 2011

Recommendation

For the Secretary’s signature to the ____________ bureau

✓ Tasked to the CAC bureau for signature by Joseph E. Macmanus Acting Assistant Secretary

Provide copy of H signed response

COMMENTS:
United States Senate
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
WASHINGTON, DC 20510-6200

April 13, 2011

Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton
U.S. Department of State
2201 C Street N.W.
Washington, DC 20520

Dear Secretary Clinton:

In has been brought to my attention that Global Fund dollars have been used to procure generic drugs at unnecessary costs in recipient countries while brand drugs remain available at a lower cost. Further, it appears that officials of the Global Fund are promoting compulsory licenses and verbally conditioning these licenses for the Global Fund grants. Information related to the procurement of high cost generics is posted on the Global Fund’s website and I have attached a compilation of the data for your review. Slides used by the Global Fund to brief officials on how to promote compulsory licenses have also been attached.

In a critical time for global health with caps placed on providing treatment to new patients in a number of the President’s Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR) countries it is extremely concerning that U.S. funded programs, such as the Global Fund, are making inefficient and unnecessarily costly procurement decisions that come with dire consequences. Unfortunately, officials of the Global Fund are promoting the use of generics without regard to the health and financial consequences it may have on the individuals benefiting from the program. It is unclear how often this has occurred, but unfortunately, these actions have likely cost millions of dollars of excessive waste and abuse of the program.

The original PEPFAR legislation was carefully written to ensure access to inexpensive life saving medication for recipient countries. The purpose of the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) Tentative Approval process for Anti-retrovirals (ARV) was to allow the program to purchase generic drugs for use only in PEPFAR countries and has been a great success. It was assumed that access to generic versions of the innovator drugs that were still under patent would provide access to lower cost medications, but the program does not require the purchase of generics. The statute is clear that treatment funds should be used in the most efficient manner. It is quite concerning that the Global Fund determines procurement policies based on the producer of the drug rather than the quality or price.

In addition, the FDA Tentative Approval process was established in partnership with innovator companies and should never be exploited. By advocating for developing countries to disregard the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS) through issuing compulsory licenses to gain access to Global Fund grants, we are abusing the system. Access to these products is vital to our success in fighting the war on HIV/AIDS and actions inconsistent with patent law such as these will only hinder our ability to work in
partnership with the companies that have provided the intellectual property rights to develop generic versions of their products. This is a humanitarian effort that requires all parties – government, non-governmental organizations, and industry – to work together towards the same goal.

I would appreciate a thorough review of the attached materials. I am requesting that you work in coordination with the Global Fund to explain the decision to purchase generic drugs at a higher cost, when brand drugs were available at a lower price. Further, the Department of State and the Global Fund should develop a specific plan of action to rectify this discrepancy for future procurement. I also request that you provide an immediate plan of action prohibiting any seminars or working groups by the Global Fund related to educating, training and advocating for countries to issue compulsory licenses.

ARV treatment and other medical care are a critical component to our success in the war against HIV/AIDS, both at home and globally. In these difficult budgetary times it is imperative that every dollar is spent in an effective and efficient manner and based on the quality and cost efficiencies of the product. Individuals around the world are depending on access to these treatments. Implementers must do everything in their power to maximize the impact of the Global Fund grants, in order to treat the greatest number of individuals possible. I look forward to your timely and thorough response to these urgent matters.

Sincerely,

Orrin G. Hatch
Ranking Member
Senate Committee on Finance
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Drug Name</th>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Quantity per Package</th>
<th>Total Number Smallest Units</th>
<th>Unit Price</th>
<th>Total Price Paid</th>
<th>Annual Treatment Cost per Patient</th>
<th>Dosage Form</th>
<th>Therapeutic Category</th>
<th>Abbott Cost</th>
<th>Manufacturer</th>
<th>Country of Manufacture</th>
<th>Date of Order</th>
<th>Grant Number</th>
<th>Source Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>99,360</td>
<td>$0.25</td>
<td>$24,706</td>
<td>545</td>
<td>Oral Solid (tablets/capsules)</td>
<td>Antiretroviral</td>
<td></td>
<td>Cipla Ltd.</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>09.12.20 05</td>
<td>BUR-202- G02-H-00</td>
<td>Global Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td></td>
<td>99,360</td>
<td>$0.25</td>
<td>$24,706</td>
<td>547.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$22,654</td>
<td>Abbott</td>
<td></td>
<td>09.12.20 05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equatorial Guinea</td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>11,520</td>
<td>$0.23</td>
<td>$2,630</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>Oral Solid (tablets/capsules)</td>
<td>Antiretroviral</td>
<td></td>
<td>Cipla Ltd.</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>22.05.20 07</td>
<td>GQN-405- G01-H</td>
<td>Global Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td></td>
<td>5,760</td>
<td>$0.46</td>
<td>$2,630</td>
<td>1,007.40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$1,313</td>
<td>Abbott</td>
<td></td>
<td>22.05.20 07</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eritrea</td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>18,000</td>
<td>$0.92</td>
<td>$16,486</td>
<td>2,006.00</td>
<td>Oral Solid (tablets/capsules)</td>
<td>Antiretroviral</td>
<td></td>
<td>Hetero Drugs Ltd.</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>01.12.20 06</td>
<td>ERT-304- G02-H</td>
<td>Global Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td></td>
<td>18,000</td>
<td>$0.92</td>
<td>$16,486</td>
<td>2,014.80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$4,104</td>
<td>Abbott</td>
<td></td>
<td>01.12.20 06</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>45,000</td>
<td>$0.71</td>
<td>$31,750</td>
<td>1,546.00</td>
<td>Oral Solid (tablets/capsules)</td>
<td>Antiretroviral</td>
<td></td>
<td>Hetero Drugs Ltd.</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>02.08.20 06</td>
<td>GMB-304- G01-H</td>
<td>Global Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td></td>
<td>45,000</td>
<td>$0.71</td>
<td>$31,750</td>
<td>1,554.90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$10,260</td>
<td>Abbott</td>
<td></td>
<td>02.08.20 06</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDF</td>
<td>No information on this purchase</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td></td>
<td>50 mg + 200 mg</td>
<td>3,480</td>
<td>$1.29</td>
<td>$4,501</td>
<td>1,883.40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$1,190</td>
<td>Abbott</td>
<td></td>
<td>10.04.20 08</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>137,700</td>
<td>$0.46</td>
<td>$62,883</td>
<td>1,001.00</td>
<td>Oral Solid (tablets/capsules)</td>
<td>Antiretroviral</td>
<td></td>
<td>Cipla Ltd.</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>23.10.20 06</td>
<td>MLW-102- G01-H-00</td>
<td>Global Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td></td>
<td>137,700</td>
<td>$0.46</td>
<td>$62,883</td>
<td>1,007.40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$31,396</td>
<td>Abbott</td>
<td></td>
<td>23.10.20 06</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>291,600</td>
<td>$0.46</td>
<td>$133,164</td>
<td>1,001.00</td>
<td>Oral Solid (tablets/capsules)</td>
<td>Antiretroviral</td>
<td></td>
<td>Cipla Ltd.</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>10.10.20 05</td>
<td>MLW-102- G01-H-00</td>
<td>Global Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td></td>
<td>291,600</td>
<td>$0.46</td>
<td>$133,164</td>
<td>1,007.40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$16,416</td>
<td>Abbott</td>
<td></td>
<td>10.10.20 05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>72,000</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>$72,320</td>
<td>2,200.00</td>
<td>Oral Solid (tablets/capsules)</td>
<td>Antiretroviral</td>
<td></td>
<td>Cipla Ltd.</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>31.10.20 05</td>
<td>SLE-405- G02-H</td>
<td>Global Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lopinavir (LPV) + Ritonavir (RTV)</td>
<td>133.3 mg + 33.3 mg</td>
<td></td>
<td>72,000</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>$72,320</td>
<td>2,190.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$16,416</td>
<td>Abbott</td>
<td></td>
<td>31.10.20 05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Global Fund Experience: access to patent information and impact on procurement of medicines

February 2011

Dr. Sophie Logez
Manager, QADM Team, Pharmaceutical Unit

Carmen Perez Casas
Senior TO, Pharmaceutical Management Unit
Content

• Global Fund:
  – Procurement and Supply Management Policies
  – Price differences among grantees

• General information from experience:
  – Management of patent issues in procurement cycle
  – Availability and quality of information

• Searching for solutions to facilitate procurement:
  – What information could be useful
  – Sustainable and simplified approaches
Use of the Global Fund Grant Funding

Expenditure by cost category

- Pharmaceutical Products, 19.7%
- Health Products and Health Equipment, 17.0%
- Human Resources, 14.6%
- Training, 11.0%
- Infrastructure and Other Equipment, 9.6%
- Planning and Administration, 5.8%
- Monitoring and Evaluation, 4.4%

37% percent of funds are used for medicines and health products procurement.
The Global Fund PSM Policy and Principles

- Procurement activities are the responsibility of the Recipient
- Global Fund policies aim to ensure that the Recipient is able to select:
  - among quality assured products (monthly list),
  - at the lowest possible price,
  - in the most adequate formulation (FDCs, children,..)
- Transparent, fair and competitive procurement
- Value for money
- Review of PSM plan and Price & Quality Reporting system
National and International Laws

Recipients must procure their products in accordance with national and international laws. The Global Fund encourages recipients to apply the flexibilities provided within national laws and in the World Trade Organization’s Agreement on Trade-related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS), as interpreted in the Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health (Doha Declaration), to achieve the lowest possible price for products of assured quality.

In the event that a Principal Recipient does not have the requisite capacity to assess the national and international intellectual property rights issues that apply to the desired products in their country, it may contract the necessary expertise using funds budgeted for this purpose in the Global Fund grant.
Global Fund HIV Financing

Countries with HIV/AIDS Grants (Rounds 1-9)

140 countries
US$ 10.8 billion (Approved Grant Amount)
US$ 17.4 billion (Total Lifetime Budget)
Global Fund Financing

Wide spectrum of countries among grantees:

- Unequal access to differential price programs of pharmaceutical companies;
- Different level of patent protection and TRIPS implementation;
- Bilateral and regional trade agreements;
- Unequal level of knowledge in IP.
Price differences across grantees: examples

Lopinavir (LPV)/Ritonavir (RTV), 200/50mg
Prices paid per year/patient in middle-income countries- since July 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country/Originator</th>
<th>Price (USD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kazakstan, Originalist</td>
<td>1,302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan, Originalist</td>
<td>1,197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madona, Originalist</td>
<td>1,020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine, Originalist</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Salvador, Originalist</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal, Generic</td>
<td>768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sudan, Generic</td>
<td>630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iran (Islamic Republic), Generic</td>
<td>621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yemen, Generic</td>
<td>574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana, Generic</td>
<td>553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia, Generic</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines, Generic</td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sao Tome and Principe, Generic</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morocco, Originalist</td>
<td>489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey, Generic</td>
<td>485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia, Generic</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania, Generic</td>
<td>466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Algeria, Generic</td>
<td>462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba, Generic</td>
<td>458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius, Generic</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesotho, Generic</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda, Generic</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua, Generic</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominican Republic, Generic</td>
<td>444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenia, Generic</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angola, Generic</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon, Generic</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt, Originalist</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cape Verde, Generic</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia, Generic</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belarus, Generic</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa, Originalist</td>
<td>430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolivia (Plurinational State), Genetic</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia, Generic</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Djibouti, Generic</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macedonia (Former Yugoslavia Republic),</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia, Generic</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Price differences across grantees/2

• Patent barriers affect some countries’ capacity to:
  – Procure lower priced versions of ARVs
  – Procure improved formulations (FDCs or children solid formulations) when they only exist as generics
    • eg. 3TC in China

• Among Global Fund grants, affected countries are middle-income countries outside Sub-saharan Africa
  – Where patents for pharmaceutical products exist for key products
  – Excluded from discounts from patent holders or eligible only to second level of discount
Price differences among grantees:

- Some of these countries are making substantial savings in grant budget by shifting to generic products (2009/2010)
  - In some cases after implementation of TRIPS flexibilities (governmental use-type licenses)

![Cost Comparison: LPV/r Prices Before and After Switch to Generics](image-url)
Management of patent issues in procurement cycle/1

- Procurement bottlenecks are common among grantees
  - weakness in forecasting, lack of capacity in PSM, problems on storage and distribution, etc

- Management of intellectual property issues is also a **procurement bottleneck**, further delaying the process
  - PSM plans (including estimated prices) are usually prepared without taking into account patent issues
  - Problems arise only late in the cycle, when procurement should actually start
  - Searching information, clarifications, etc. creates long delays
  - This leads to emergency procurement to avoid treatment disruption/stocks outs
Management of patent issues in procurement cycle/2

• Information about patents (and patent law) is not readily available.
• Delays on clarifying situation and potential options for the countries due to:
  – Disconnection between Ministry of Health and other authorities (trade, industry..)
  – Confusion with registration of medicines
  – Lack expertise of Procurement offices in countries

• Technical assistance possible with Global Fund grants but not very often requested
Management of patent issues in procurement cycle/3

- **Procurement agents** used by grantees:
  - In some cases, responsibility placed at country level for compliance with national law
    - acceptance of governmental use licenses
  - Or, request for patent status for all products in the order
  - Generally, limited patent search:
    - difficulties faced on doing patent search and very resource demanding
    - responsibility for verifying information placed at country level

In any case, time limit assessment to avoid stocks outs
Availability and quality of information

- Information about patent status often available only from the originator company (letters)
- If no information, or when information available from originator and other available information are not coincident → Chilling effect
  - procurement agent unwilling to take risks (e.g. China lamivudine)
  - generic companies refusal to quote (e.g. Guatemala)
  - Pressure of time
  - And eventually procurement of higher priced products
Availability and quality of information

• Validity of searches conducted at country level?
  
  – In many cases, search in local patent office done only using product name (INN) and formulation details.
    E.g. Key search word: Atazanavir 300 mg tablets.
  
  – With secondary patents, on new forms, combinations, ..
    How to ensure all possible patents are covered in search? (e.g. syrups )
  
  – Need for further guidance to patent offices on moving forward (new ARVs, increase in secondary patent applications)
More recent ARVs

Darunavir prices paid per year/patient by all Recipients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Price USD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>West Bank and Gaza Strip</td>
<td>13,082</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>10,646</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>8,468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>7,424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>6,643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Salvador</td>
<td>6,570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>5,500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1,095$ offered by patent holder to Sub-Saharan Africa and LDCs

Reported Cost: USD Per Person Per Year
What patent information could be useful for facilitating procurement process?

- Public list of basic and secondary patents of key products and formulations
  - date and numbers
  - E.g. UNAIDS/MSF/WHO 2004

- On-line data-base or consultation service
  - Specifically important now for middle income countries
  - E.g. WIPO
Guidance and simplified tools

- Guidance for developing capacity at country level:
  E.g. WHO 2010, UNDP

- Once patent status known, in some cases will need Technical Assistance to determine options for procurement of lower-priced generics

- Need for simplified solutions for managing IP rights upfront ➔ Medicines Patent Pool